Transforming Peer Review Bibliography

Charles W. Bailey, Jr.

Houston: Digital Scholarship, 2014

Introduction

The *Transforming Peer Review Bibliography* presents English-language articles that are useful in understanding significant transformations of the peer review process. Most sources were published from 2010 through 2012. It is available as a website and a website PDF with live links.

The peer review process is gradually changing. David Shotton's "The Five Stars of Online Journal Articles—A Framework for Article Evaluation" and Emily Ford's "Defining and Characterizing Open Peer Review: A Review of the Literature" provide good overviews of this broad topic. This bibliography is concerned with major changes to peer review, such as open peer review (excluding just revealing the identity of traditional peer reviewers) and post-publication review. Here's Shotton's definition of open peer review:

> The whole review process is entirely transparent. Each submitted manuscript is immediately made available on the journal's website. Reviews and comments from readers are welcomed, and are considered alongside the formal peer reviews solicited from experts by the journal. All the reviews, the author's responses, and the original and final versions of the article are published, and the appointed reviewers and editors are acknowledged by name in the final version.

This is not a bibliography that treats open access in general or overlay journals.

Bibliography

Bachmann, Talis. "Fair And Open Evaluation May Call for Temporarily Hidden Authorship, Caution When Counting the Votes, and Transparency of the Full Pre-publication Procedure " *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 5, no. 61 (2011). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2011.00061/full

Birukou, Aliaksandr, Joseph Rushton Wakeling, Claudio Bartolini, Fabio Casati, Maurizio Marchese, Katsiaryna Mirylenka, Nardine Osman, Azzurra Ragone, Carles Sierra, and Aalam Wassef. "Alternatives to Peer Review: Novel Approaches for Research Evaluation." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 5, no. 56 (2011). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2011.00056/full

Boldt, Axel. "Extending ArXiv.org to Achieve Open Peer Review and Publishing." *Journal of Scholarly Publishing* 42, no. 2 (2011): 238-242. http://arxiv.org/abs/1011.6590

Bornmann, Lutz, and Hans-Dieter Daniel. "Reliability of Reviewers' Ratings When Using Public Peer Review: A Case Study." *Learned Publishing* 23, no. 2 (2010): 124-131. https://doi.org/10.1087/20100207

Bornmann, Lutz, Werner Marx, Hermann Schier, Andreas Thor, and Hans-Dieter Daniel. "From Black Box to White Box at Open Access Journals: Predictive Validity of Manuscript Reviewing and Editorial Decisions at *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics*." *Research Evaluation* 19, no. 2 (2010): 105-118. *http://rev.oxfordjournals.org/content/19/2/105.short*

Bornmann, Lutz, Christoph Neuhaus, and Hans-Dieter Daniel. "The Effect of a Two-Stage Publication Process on the Journal Impact Factor: A Case Study on the Interactive Open

Access Journal *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics*." *Scientometrics* 86, no. 1 (2011): 93-97. *http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs11192-010-0250-4*

Bornmann, Lutz, Hermann Schier, Werner Marx, and Hans-Dieter Daniel. "Is Interactive Open Access Publishing Able to Identify High-Impact Submissions? A Study on the Predictive Validity of *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics* by Using Percentile Rank Classes." *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology* 62, no. 1 (2011): 61-71. *http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/asi.21418/abstract*

Bornmann, Lutz, Markus Wolf, and Hans-Dieter Daniel. "Closed versus Open Reviewing of Journal Manuscripts: How Far Do Comments Differ in Language Use?" *Scientometrics* 91, no. 3, (2012): 843-856. *http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs11192-011-0569-5*

Eyre-Walker, Adam, and Nina Stoletzki. "The Assessment of Science: The Relative Merits of Post-publication Review, the Impact Factor, and the Number of Citations." *PLOS Biology* 11, no. 10 (2013): e1001675. http://www.plosbiology.org/article/info:doi/10.1371/journal.pbio.1001675

Fitzpatrick, Kathleen. "Peer-to-peer Review and the Future of Scholarly Authority." *Social Epistemology: A Journal of Knowledge, Culture and Policy* 24, no. 3 (2010): 161-179. *http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/02691728.2010.498929?journalCode=tsep2*

Fitzpatrick, Kathleen, and Katherine Rowe. "Keywords for Open Peer Review." *Logos* 21, no. 3 (2010): 133-141. http://works.bepress.com/katherine_rowe/5/

Florian, Razvan V. "Aggregating Post-publication Peer Reviews and Ratings." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 6, no. 31 (2012). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00031/full

Ford, Emily. "Defining and Characterizing Open Peer Review: A Review of the Literature." *Journal of Scholarly Publishing* 44, no. 4 (2013): 311-326. http://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/ulib_fac/1/

Ginsparg, Paul. "Can Peer Review Be Better Focused?" *Science & Technology Libraries* 22, no. 3/4 (2002): 5-17. http://people.ccmr.cornell.edu/~ginsparg/blurb/pg02pr.html

Herron, Daniel M. "Is Expert Peer Review Obsolete? A Model Suggests That Post-publication Reader Review May Exceed the Accuracy of Traditional Peer Review." *Surgical Endoscopy* 26, no. 8 (2012): 2275-2280. *http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s00464-012-2171-1*

Hunter, Jane. "Post-publication Peer Review: Opening Up Scientific Conversation." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 6, no. 63 (2012). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00063/full

Jefferson, Tom. "Quality and Value: Models of Quality Control for Scientific Research." *Nature* (2006). http://www.nature.com/nature/peerreview/debate/nature05031.html

Koop, Thomas, and Ulrich Pöschl. "Systems: An Open, Two-stage Peer-Review Journal." *Nature* (2006). http://www.nature.com/nature/peerreview/debate/nature04988.html

Kravitz, Dwight J., and Chris I. Baker. "Toward a New Model of Scientific Publishing: Discussion and a Proposal." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 5, no. 55 (2011). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2011.00055/full

Kriegeskorte, Nikolaus. "Open Evaluation: A Vision for Entirely Transparent Post-publication Peer Review and Rating for Science." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 6, no. 79 (2012). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00079/full

Kriegeskorte, Nikolaus, Alexander Walther, and Diana Deca. "An Emerging Consensus for Open Evaluation: 18 Visions for the Future of Scientific Publishing." *Frontiers in*

Computational Neuroscience 6, no. 94 (2012).
http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00094/full

Lee, Christopher. "Open Peer Review by a Selected-Papers Network." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 6, no. 1 (2012).
http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00001/abstract

Melero, R., and F. López-Santoveña. "Referees' Attitudes toward Open Peer Review and Electronic Transmission of Papers." *Food Science and Technology International* 7, no. 6 (2001): 521-527. *http://fst.sagepub.com/content/7/6/521.abstract*

Perakakis, Pandelis, Michael Taylor, Marco G. Mazza, and Varvara Trachana. "Understanding the Role of Open Peer Review and Dynamic Academic Articles." *Scientometrics* 88, no. 2 (2011): 669-673.
http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs11192-011-0402-1

Pöschl, Ulrich. "Interactive Journal Concept for Improved Scientific Publishing and Quality Assurance." *Learned Publishing* 17, no. 2 (2004): 105-113.
https://doi.org/10.1087/095315104322958481

———. "Interactive Open Access Publishing and Peer Review: The Effectiveness and Perspectives of Transparency and Self-Regulation in Scientific Communication and Evaluation " *LIBER Quarterly* 19, no. 3/4 (2010). https://doi.org/10.18352/lq.7967

———. "Interactive Open Access Publishing and Public Peer Review: The Effectiveness of Transparency and Self-Regulation in Scientific Quality Assurance." *IFLA Journal* 36, no. 1 (2010): 40-46. http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/hq/publications/ifla-journal/ifla-journal-36-1_2010.pdf

———. "Multi-stage Open Peer Review: Scientific Evaluation Integrating the Strengths of Traditional Peer Review with the Virtues of Transparency and Self-Regulation." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 6, no. 33 (2012).
http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00033/full

Sandewall, Erik. "A Hybrid System of Peer Review." *Nature* (2006).
http://www.nature.com/nature/peerreview/debate/nature04994.html

———. "Maintaining Live Discussion In Two-Stage Open Peer Review " *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 21, no. 9 (2012).
http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00009/full

Sekhara, D. M. R., and Naresh Chander Aery. "Open Review of Science Publications." *Accountability in Research: Policies and Quality Assurance* 17, no. 5 (2010): 257-263.
http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/08989621.2010.511548?journalCode=gacr20

Shotton, David. "The Five Stars of Online Journal Articles—A Framework for Article Evaluation." *D-Lib Magazine* 18, no. 1/2 (2012).
http://www.dlib.org/dlib/january12/shotton/01shotton.html

Solomon, David J. "The Role of Peer Review for Scholarly Journals in the Information Age." *Journal of Electronic Publishing* 11, no. 1 (2007).
http://dx.doi.org/10.3998/3336451.0010.107

Stamm, Thomas, Ulrich Meyer, Peter Wiesmann, Johannes Kleinheinz, Murat Cehreli, and Zafer C Cehreli. "A Retrospective Analysis of Submissions, Acceptance Rate, Open Peer Review Operations, and Prepublication Bias of the Multidisciplinary Open Access Journal *Head & Face Medicine* " *Head & Face Medicine* 3, no. 27 (2007).
http://link.springer.com/article/10.1186%2F1746-160X-3-27

Stodolsky, David S. "Consensus Journals: Invitational Journals Based upon Peer Review." *The Information Society: An International Journal* 11, no. 4 (1995): 247-260.

http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/01972243.1995.9960199?journalCode=utis20

Suárez, Andrea L., Jeffrey D. Bernhard, and Robert P. Dellavalle. "Hiding Behind the Curtain: Anonymous versus Open Peer Review." In *Dermatoethics: Contemporary Ethics and Professionalism in Dermatology*, edited by Lionel Bercovitch and Clifford Perlis, 221-225. London: Springer, 2012. http://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007%2F978-1-4471-2191-6_36

Sumner, Tamara, and Simon Buckingham Shum. "Open Peer Review & Argumentation: Loosening the Paper Chains on Journals." *Ariadne*, no. 5 (1996). http://www.ariadne.ac.uk/issue5/jime

Till, James. "Peer Review in a Post-eprints World: A Proposal." *Journal of Medical Internet Research* 2, no. 3 (2000): e14. http://www.jmir.org/2000/3/e14/

Walsh, Elizabeth, Maeve Rooney, Louis Appleby, and Greg Wilkinson. "Open Peer Review: A Randomised Controlled Trial." *The British Journal of Psychiatry* 176 (2000): 47-51. http://bjp.rcpsych.org/content/176/1/47

Walther, Alexander, and Jasper J. F. van den Bosch. "FOSE: A Framework for Open Science Evaluation." *Frontiers in Computational Neuroscience* 6, no. 32 (2012). http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/10.3389/fncom.2012.00032/full

Wardle, David A. "Do 'Faculty of 1000' (F1000) Ratings of Ecological Publications Serve as Reasonable Predictors of Their Future Impact?" *Ideas in Ecology and Evolution* 3 (2010). http://library.queensu.ca/ojs/index.php/IEE/article/viewArticle/2379

Ware, Mark. "Peer Review: Recent Experience and Future Directions." *New Review of Information Networking* 16, no. 1 (2011): 23-53. http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13614576.2011.566812

Wets, Kathleen, Dave Weedon, and Jan Velterop. "Post-publication Filtering and Evaluation: Faculty of 1000." *Learned Publishing* 16, no. 4 (2003): 249-258. https://doi.org/10.1087/095315103322421982

About the Author

Charles W. Bailey, Jr. is the publisher of Digital Scholarship. He has over 30 years of information and instructional technology experience, including 24 years of managerial experience in academic libraries. From 2004 to 2007, he was the Assistant Dean for Digital Library Planning and Development at the University of Houston Libraries. From 1987 to 2003, he served as Assistant Dean/Director for Systems at the University of Houston Libraries.

Previously, he served as Head, Systems and Research Services at the Health Sciences Library, The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill; Systems Librarian at the Milton S. Eisenhower Library, The Johns Hopkins University; User Documentation Specialist at the OCLC Online Computer Library Center; and Media Library Manager at the Learning Resources Center, SUNY College at Oswego. For more details, see the "Brief Resume of Charles W. Bailey, Jr."

Bailey has been an open access publisher for over 24 years. In 1989, Bailey established PACS-L, a mailing list about public-access computers in libraries, and *The Public-Access Computer Systems Review*, the first open access journal in the field of library and information science. He served as PACS-L Moderator until November 1991 and as Editor-in-Chief of *The Public-Access Computer Systems Review* until the end of 1996.

In 1990, Bailey and Dana Rooks established *Public-Access Computer Systems News*, an electronic newsletter, and Bailey co-edited this publication until 1992.

In 1992, he founded the PACS-P mailing list for announcing the publication of selected e-serials, and he moderated this list until 2007.

In 1996, he established the *Scholarly Electronic Publishing Bibliography* (*SEPB*), an open access book that was updated 80 times.

In 2001, he added the *Scholarly Electronic Publishing Weblog*, which announces relevant new publications, to *SEPB*.

In 2001, he was selected as a team member of *Current Cites*, and he has subsequently been a frequent contributor of reviews to this monthly e-serial.

In 2005, he published the *Open Access Bibliography: Liberating Scholarly Literature with E-prints and Open Access Journals* with the Association of Research Libraries (also a website).

In 2005, Bailey established Digital Scholarship (http://digital-scholarship.org/), which provides information and commentary about digital copyright, digital curation, digital repositories, open access, scholarly communication, and other digital information issues. Digital Scholarship's digital publications are open access. Publications are under versions of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial License.

He also established *DigitalKoans*, a weblog that covers the same topics as Digital Scholarship.

From February 2005 through January 2014, he published the following books and book supplements: the *Scholarly Electronic Publishing Bibliography: 2008 Annual Edition* (2009), *Digital Scholarship 2009* (2010), *Transforming Scholarly Publishing through Open Access: A Bibliography* (2010), the *Scholarly Electronic Publishing Bibliography 2010* (2011), the *Digital Curation and Preservation Bibliography 2010* (2011), the *Institutional Repository and ETD Bibliography 2011* (2011), the *Digital Curation Bibliography: Preservation and Stewardship of Scholarly Works* (2012), and the *Digital Curation Bibliography: Preservation and Stewardship of Scholarly Works, 2012 Supplement* (2013).

During this period, he also published and updated the following bibliographies and webliographies as websites with links to freely available works: the *Scholarly Electronic Publishing Bibliography* (1996-2011), the *Electronic Theses and Dissertations Bibliography* (2005-2012), the *Google Books Bibliography* (2005-2011), the *Institutional Repository Bibliography* (2009-2011), the *Open Access Journals Bibliography* (2010), the *Digital Curation and Preservation Bibliography* (2010-2011), the *E-science and Academic Libraries Bibliography* (2011), the *Digital Curation Resource Guide* (2012), the *Research Data Curation Bibliography* (2012-2013),the *Altmetrics Bibliography* (2013), and the *Transforming Peer Review Bibliography* (2014).

For more details, see the "Digital Scholarship Publications Overview."

In 2010, Bailey was given a Best Content by an Individual Award by *The Charleston Advisor*. In 2003, he was named as one of *Library Journal*'s "Movers & Shakers." In 1993, he was awarded the first LITA/Library Hi Tech Award For Outstanding Communication for Continuing Education in Library and Information Science.

In 1973, Bailey won a Wallace Stevens Poetry Award. He is the author of *The Cave of Hypnos: Early Poems*, which includes several poems that won that award.

Bailey has written over 30 papers about digital copyright, expert systems, institutional repositories, open access, scholarly communication, and other topics. See the "Selected Publications of Charles W. Bailey, Jr." for a more complete description of his publications.

He has served on the editorial boards of *Information Technology and Libraries*, *Library Software Review*, and *Reference Services Review*.

Bailey uses Photoshop and other digital image manipulation programs to create digital art, and he makes it available at his Flickr photostream and Flickr RSS feed.

He holds master's degrees in information and library science and instructional media and technology.

Citation

Charles W. Bailey, Jr., *Transforming Peer Review Bibliography* (Houston: Digital Scholarship, 2014), http://digital-scholarship.org/tpr/tpr.htm.

Bailey, Charles W., Jr. *Transforming Peer Review Bibliography*. Houston: Digital Scholarship, 2014. http://digital-scholarship.org/tpr/tpr.htm.

Digital Scholarship